

City of Regina Heritage Holding Bylaw Evaluation Form	Evaluation Date January 15, 2018
	Community District Downtown
	Designation City of Regina
The place should be rated for each of the criteria below, in order to establish its relative significance. This will determine if the place merits inclusion on the City of Regina Heritage Holding Bylaw, or not, and whether it is Grade 2 (Moderate/High Heritage Significance) or Grade 1 (Exceptional/Outstanding Heritage Significance).	

Site Name(s): McAra Block (Peoples Credit Jewellers Building)											
Municipal Address: 1855 Scarth Street		Date of Construction: 1912									
Legal Address: Lot 14, Block 306, Plan Old 33 Area: 290m ²											
Architectural Style: Edwardian Classical style Architect: Unknown Builder: Unknown											
Consultant(s): Donald Luxton & Associates		<table border="1"> <tr> <td>Evaluation Date:</td> <td>Y</td> <td>M</td> <td>D</td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td>18</td> <td>01</td> <td>15</td> </tr> </table>		Evaluation Date:	Y	M	D		18	01	15
Evaluation Date:	Y	M	D								
	18	01	15								
Heritage Committee: N/A											
Heritage Planner: N/A											



Statement of Significance	Site Name McAra Block
----------------------------------	--------------------------

Site Name: McAra Block
Municipal Address: 1855 Scarth Street

Description of Historic Place:
The three-storey McAra Block is a commercial building located in Regina's downtown at 1855 Scarth Street. The façade of the upper two floors is faced with stone and topped with a prominent cornice and central date stone.

Heritage Value of Historic Place:
The aesthetic value of the McAra Block, constructed in 1912, resides in its subdued Edwardian Classical style. Elements of this style include symmetry, a prominent cornice and the simple treatment of windows, in this example with keystone and voussoirs. The construction of simple yet pronounced pilasters on each edge of the building and the rectangular window pattern emphasize the vertical dimension of the building. The stone façade creates the appearance of a solid and functional commercial building. The ground floor façade was rehabilitated in the 1990s to connect the buildings on the east side of the Frederick W. Hill Mall with an interior pedestrian corridor.

The historic value of the McAra Block also resides in its association with brothers Peter and James McAra, early Regina pioneers, businessmen and community leaders. The building was constructed for McAra and Wallace, a real estate and insurance company. Peter McAra opened a fire insurance business in Regina in 1896 and, among other achievements, was mayor in 1906 and 1911-12. His younger brother, James, was the first page of the North West Territories Council at age ten. James later served in the First World War. He was the first Saskatchewan president of the Great War Veterans' Association, the precursor to the Royal Canadian Legion, and was instrumental in establishing Regina's Soldiers' Cemetery, which opened in 1920. James McAra was Regina's mayor in 1927-30 and 1932-33. While the McAra Block initially attracted various professional tenants, like many other downtown buildings it became a rooming house throughout the years. Peoples Credit Jewellers occupied the block between 1949 and the late 1980s.

The heritage value of the property also resides in its contribution to the early 20th century commercial streetscape of the 1800 block of Scarth Street, now known as the Frederick W. Hill Mall. Collectively, the buildings represent Regina's most intact concentration of pre-First World War commercial architecture.

Character Defining Elements:
The character defining elements include but are not limited to:

- small three-storey commercial form and narrow, vertical massing contributing to the small-scale streetscape;
- ground floor storefront;
- simple ashlar stone facade;
- elements of the Edwardian Classical style such as symmetry, prominent denticulated cornice and simple treatment of window openings with keystone and voussoirs above the second floor windows;
- recessed panels between the second and third floor windows;
- prominent end pilasters;
- central date stone.

Elements which reflect the connection of the building to early Regina pioneers, businessmen and community leaders, Peter and James McAra, including:

- continued use of the McAra Block name.

Those elements which speak to the connection of the building to Regina's early pre-First World War building boom, including:

- location of the building on its original site and adjacent to other buildings of the same era.



McAra Block, 2010 (City of Regina)



Stone parapet with date of construction crest and stone cornice with dentils, 2010 (City of Regina).



Stone voissours, window surrounds, and sills, with recessed panels between floors, 2010 (City of Regina)



Prominent cornice with dentils, 2010 (City of Regina)

Statement of Integrity	Site Name McAra Block
-------------------------------	---------------------------------

Values Summary:

The aesthetic value of the McAra Block, constructed in 1912, resides in its subdued Edwardian Classical style. Elements of this style include symmetry, a prominent cornice and the simple treatment of windows, in this example with keystone and voussoirs.

The historic value of the McAra Block also resides in its association with brothers Peter and James McAra, early Regina pioneers, businessmen and community leaders.

The heritage value of the property also resides in its contribution to the early 20th century commercial streetscape of the 1800 block of Scarth Street, now known as the Frederick W. Hill Mall.

Period of Significance: 1906-1913 Pre-First World War, Age of Optimism

Chronology of Alterations (point form):

1990s

- Ground floor front façade rehabilitated

Pre-2010

- Windows replaced

Aspects of Integrity:

1. LOCATION	Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No <input type="checkbox"/>	N/A <input type="checkbox"/>
Location is the place where an historic resource was constructed or the site where an historic activity or event occurred.			
2. DESIGN	Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No <input type="checkbox"/>	N/A <input type="checkbox"/>
Design is the combination of elements that create the form, plan, space, structure and style of a resource.			
3. ENVIRONMENT	Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No <input type="checkbox"/>	N/A <input type="checkbox"/>
Environment is the physical setting of an historic resource. Whereas location refers to a specific place, environment refers to the character of the place in which a resource played its historic role.			
4. MATERIALS	Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No <input type="checkbox"/>	N/A <input type="checkbox"/>
Materials are the physical elements that were combined or deposited during a particular period(s) or time frame and in a particular pattern or configuration to form an historic resource.			
5. WORKMANSHIP	Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No <input type="checkbox"/>	N/A <input type="checkbox"/>
Workmanship is the physical evidence of the crafts of a particular culture or people during any given period in history. It is important because it can provide information about technological practices and aesthetic principles.			
6. ASSOCIATION	Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No <input type="checkbox"/>	N/A <input type="checkbox"/>
Association is a <i>direct link</i> between an historic resource and a significant historical theme, activity or event, or an institution or person.			
<p>Statement of Integrity: <u>McAra Block</u> maintains all the aspects of integrity necessary for it to convey its significance/heritage value.</p> <p>The building's original form, scale, and massing are intact. The building retains all of its original fabric and architectural elements.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Foundation: Could not be assessed using photographs provided. - Cladding: Stone is in good condition overall. Split block pilasters on first floor are in good condition with some chips and cracks present. The Tyndall stone bases are original with chips to outside corners and light staining. Stone on the second and third floors is in good condition with some cracks, staining, and mortar loss. The top and underside of the rooftop cornice is stained as is the cap on the parapet. - Roof: Could not be assessed using photographs provided. - Roof elements: Parapet cap is original and in good condition. - Windows: All windows have been replaced. The size of the second and third floor window openings has been retained. The storefront has been replaced. - Doors: Front doors have been replaced and concrete step and metal balustrade added. - Chimney: Could not be assessed using photographs provided. - Other: Crest on parapet with construction date is original and in good condition. 			
Criteria of Significance	Site Name McAra Block		

CRITERIA	Level of Heritage Significance			
	N/A	Low	Moderate	High
1. The place is closely and meaningfully associated with one or more themes, events, periods of time, or cultural traditions considered important in the history of Regina. <i>(Historic)</i>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2. The place is strongly associated with the life or work of a person, group of persons, or institution(s) of importance	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

in Regina's history. (Historic)				
3. The place is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or represents an important creative achievement in design, architecture, landscape architecture, planning, construction, materials, or technology. (<i>Aesthetic, Architectural, Technical</i>)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
4. The community, or a social or cultural group within the community, is deeply attached to the place for social, cultural, or spiritual reasons. (<i>Social, Cultural, Spiritual</i>)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
5. The place, by virtue of its location, its symbolism, or some other element, serves to communicate the heritage of Regina to a broad audience. (<i>Landmark, Symbolism</i>)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
6. The place could yield important information that will contribute to the understanding of Regina's past. (<i>Scientific, Educational</i>)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
7. The place possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of Regina 's cultural history. (<i>Historic, Rarity</i>)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
8. The place is important in the historic urban development of the neighbourhood or city. (<i>Context, Landscape, Urban Context, Group Value</i>)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Based on the above criteria, does the place merit inclusion on the Inventory? (at least 1 'High' or 4 'Moderate')

NO:

YES:

Does the place possess **exceptional/outstanding** qualities for any of the criteria listed above? If yes, explain:

NO:
(result is GRADE 2)

YES:
(result is GRADE 1)

Does the place retain sufficient integrity to convey significance? If not, the place will **not** qualify.

NO:

YES:

FINAL EVALUATION

GRADE 2:

GRADE 1:

Date Evaluated by Donald Luxton & Associates:

January 15, 2018

Date Approved by City of Regina:

February 13, 2019

EXPLANATORY NOTES

Eligibility for inclusion the Heritage Holding Bylaw:

- Places must be *at least 20 years old* to be eligible for inclusion.
- Places include: buildings, structures, groups of buildings or structures, landscape features (gardens, but not individual trees unless commemorative), cultural landscapes and engineering works.
- Excluded places include archaeological sites, individual trees unless commemorative, movable objects and intangible heritage.

Assessing Level of Heritage Significance:

Within each criterion, there should be a comparison of the place to similar places within the City of Regina in order to determine the relative merit of the place.

CRITERIA 1 – This criterion assesses the place’s association with broad themes, events, periods of time and cultural traditions of local/civic history, including settlement patterns, economic growth/ production, community development, cultural knowledge base and traditions, and government systems. The themes have been established in the city’s Historic Context and Thematic Framework Document available on the city’s website.

N/A	The place exhibits a limited connection to one or more of the identified city-wide historic themes or subthemes.
Low	The place exhibits a recognizable connection to one or more of the identified city-wide historic themes or subthemes.
Moderate	The place exhibits a significant connection to one or more of the identified city-wide historic themes or subthemes.
High	The place exhibits a direct connection to one or more of the identified city-wide historic themes or subthemes and is an excellent, tangible expression of one or more of the themes/subthemes.

CRITERIA 2 – This criterion assesses the place’s association with a particular person, group of people or institution(s), including the importance of the architect, builder, landscape architect, or planner.

N/A	Little or no known historic association.
Low	Connected with a person, social or cultural group, or institution that is of limited importance to the neighbourhood.
Moderate	Closely connected with a person, social or cultural group, or institution that is of considerable importance to the neighbourhood, or moderate importance to the city.
High	Closely connected with a person, social or cultural group, or institution that is of considerable importance to the city, province or nation.

CRITERIA 3 – This criterion assesses the place’s architectural significance; its expression of style; its design details and features; its building materials; its method of construction; and its planning context.

N/A	An average example of a style, type, design or technology that remains common in Regina.
Low	A good example of a style, type, design or technology that is common in Regina or in a neighbourhood.
Moderate	A very good example of a style, type, design or technology in Regina or in a neighbourhood, or a good example of a style, type or design that is notably early or rare in Regina or in a neighbourhood.
High	An excellent example of a style, type, design or technology in Regina or one of few surviving and very good examples of a style, type, design or technology in Regina.

CRITERIA 4 – This criterion assesses evidence of a strong/special association between the place and a particular community/cultural group.

N/A	The place possesses limited social, cultural or spiritual value.
Low	There is a weak social, cultural or spiritual connection between the place and a particular community/cultural group.
Moderate	There is a moderate social, cultural or spiritual connection between the place and a particular community/cultural group.

High There is a strong social, cultural or spiritual connection between the place and a particular community/cultural group.

CRITERIA 5 – This criterion assesses the visual landmark status or cultural, spiritual or symbolic value of the place.

N/A A place of no landmark or symbolic significance.

Low A landmark in an immediate area or a place of symbolic importance to an immediate area.

Moderate A major landmark within a neighbourhood or a place of symbolic importance to a neighbourhood.

High A landmark of civic importance or a place of significant symbolic value to the city, province or nation.

CRITERIA 6 – This criterion assesses the physical fabric, documentary evidence, or oral history relating to the place that could yield meaningful information about Regina’s cultural history.

N/A The place is not able communicate the history of the immediate area, neighbourhood, or city.

Low The place communicates (physically or through documented/oral evidence) an aspect or aspects of the immediate area’s history.

Moderate The place communicates (physically or through documented/oral evidence) an aspect or aspects of history on a neighbourhood scale.

High The place directly communicates (physically or through documented/oral evidence) an aspect or aspects integral to the historic or cultural development of Regina, or is of provincial or national importance.

CRITERIA 7 – This criterion assesses how rare or uncommon the place is within Regina, or whether it is among a small number of extant places that demonstrate an important style, phase, event, etc.

N/A There are a significant number of similar places.

Low The place demonstrates an uncommon, rare or endangered aspect of the immediate area’s cultural history.

Moderate The place demonstrates an uncommon, rare or endangered aspect of the neighbourhood’s cultural history.

High The place demonstrates an uncommon, rare or endangered aspect of the city’s cultural history.

CRITERIA 8 – This criterion assesses the significance of the place (building, landscape, urban context) within the historic urban development of the neighbourhood and/or city, including its place within a group of similar buildings, landscapes, or cultural landscapes.

N/A A place with little evidence of a recognizable historic pattern.

Low A place that provides some evidence of an historic pattern of importance for the immediate area.

Moderate A place that can be directly linked to the establishment of an historic pattern of neighbourhood importance.

High A place that can be directly linked to the establishment of an historic pattern of civic importance.

BASED ON THE EIGHT CRITERIA, THE PLACE MERITS INCLUSION ON REGINA’S HISTORIC RESOURCES INVENTORY WITH AT LEAST 1 ‘HIGH’ RATING OR AT LEAST 4 ‘MODERATE’ RATINGS.

THRESHOLDS

- **Ranking:** If a place demonstrates **exceptional** or **outstanding** qualities for any of the criteria (above a ‘High’ level), it would be considered a **Grade 1** place with *city-wide significance*, whereas a place that does not exceed a ‘High’ level in any of the criteria would be considered a **Grade 2** place with *neighbourhood-wide significance*.
- **Integrity:** This refers to the degree to which the heritage values of the place are still evident/authentic, and can be understood and appreciated (for example, the degree to which the

original design or use of a place can still be discerned). This includes authenticity of materials, technology and design. If considerable change to the place has occurred, the significant values may not be readily identifiable. Changes that are reversible are not considered to affect integrity. In the City of Regina, degree of integrity is evaluated by a Statement of Integrity, included in this evaluation.